

From Judgment to Impact Agenda Draft

April 3 – 4, 2018
Santa Fe Institute
1399 Hyde Park Road
Santa Fe, New Mexico 87501

The Key questions that we are addressing:

1. Is it possible to enumerate and to some degree formalize what we mean by scholarly judgment and how has this challenge been addressed in the past in relation to new or challenging ideas?
2. What are suitable tools and measures for helping to exercise sound judgment without becoming excessively reductive or quantitatively fetishistic?
3. How can we improve our judgment in areas that have a limited history or that represent a genuinely new approach to a problem?
4. How can we measure impact more broadly than through citations?
e.g., a) The diversity of areas or journals or news sources in which an idea has been acknowledged b) the use of the idea as a key element or catalyst in a more conventionally successful idea?
5. What can we do differently today and what technologies and platforms could we help to develop that respect the complexity of the problem? And how can we assess what Google Scholar and the like have been missing?
6. What role can SFI and its network partners play in this transformation of judgment and impact and how can we help federal agencies, foundations and other funders better capture new talent and new ideas?

Meeting Format

We are pursuing a somewhat unconventional meeting format aimed at open discussion around a series of key areas.

We shall ask each participant to present their ideas as informally (discussion) or as formally (slides) as they wish and use each speaker as a catalytic center around which to build insights. Talks/discussions are anticipated to be from 20-30 minutes in length.

Participants are free to assign themselves to a theme area as they wish during the course of the meeting to ensure the best fit and flow of conversation.

Meeting Schedule**Tuesday, April 3, 2018**

8:15 AM	Shuttle departs Hotel Santa Fe for SFI
8:30 - 9:00 AM	Breakfast at SFI
9:00 - 9:15	Welcome and Introductions
9:15 - 9:30	Motivation for the meeting David Krakauer (<i>President, Santa Fe Institute</i>), and Manfred Laubichler (<i>Arizona State University</i>)
9:30 - 10:30	Theme 1: The History, Meaning and Value of Judgment and Impact
10:30 - 10:45	Coffee Break
10:45 - 12:00	Theme 2: Measures, Metrics and Visualizations of judgment and impact.
12:00 – 1:00PM	Lunch
1:00 - 3:00	Theme 3: Novel approaches to judgment and impact: platforms, diversity, and innovation
3:00 - 3:30	Afternoon Tea
3:30 - 4:45	Theme 4: Building a new environment and culture for the scientific investigation and maturation of judgment and impact.
5:00	Shuttle departs for Hotel Santa Fe
6:30 – 8:30	Group Dinner La Boca, 72 W. Marcy Street (505) 982-3433

Wednesday April 4, 2018 (for those who are participating in the second day)

8:15 AM	Shuttle departs Hotel Santa Fe for SFI
8:30 - 9:00 AM	Breakfast at SFI
9:00 - 10:30	Group Discussion: Synthesis of 4 major Themes: Can we develop model cases for judging impact based on a more inclusive set of values representing science? What are the methodological, infrastructure and political conditions that need to be addressed?

SANTA FE INSTITUTE

10:30 - 10:45	Coffee Break
10:45 – 12:00	Can we develop a proposal for implementing such a program?
12:00 – 1:00PM	Lunch
1:00 - 3:00 PM	Time for individual and group discussions
3:00 - 3:30	Afternoon Tea
3:30	Shuttle departs for Hotel Santa Fe